A National Conversation on Indoor Air & K-12 Schools During the COVID-19 Pandemic

Webinar on February 23, 2021

WEBVTT

1 00:00:23.010 --> 00:00:30.450
Prarthana Vasudevan: Welcome to today’s webinar a national conversation on indoor air and schools during the COPA 19 pandemic.

2 00:00:31.680 --> 00:00:35.670
Prarthana Vasudevan: Our moderator Dr Paula ozersky will now begin.

3 00:00:37.980 --> 00:00:38.700
Paula Olsiewski: Thank you.

4 00:00:40.230 --> 00:01:06.360
Paula Olsiewski: Good afternoon, thanks so much for joining us today for this very important event a national conversation on indoor air schools and the pandemic, my name is Paula osu ski I contributing scholar at the Johns Hopkins Center for health, security, where I lead our indoor air team.

5 00:01:08.790 --> 00:01:14.730
Paula Olsiewski: The coven 19 pandemic has had catastrophic impact on children’s education.

6 00:01:16.620 --> 00:01:26.430
Paula Olsiewski: The schools have had to keep adapting to ever changing policies related to in person schooling.

7 00:01:28.380 --> 00:01:36.510
Paula Olsiewski: Teachers and staff have struggled with limited guidance and resources for teaching safely.

8 00:01:38.640 --> 00:01:50.280
Paula Olsiewski: children and their families have had to cope with so much time trying to assess so many risks against the various benefits.
Paula Olsiewski: there's lots of guidance for schools out there.

Paula Olsiewski: And there are resources for school administrators for the prevention and mitigation of covert transmission.

Paula Olsiewski: But, for some reason.

Paula Olsiewski: ventilation in schools, which was an issue, even prior to this pandemic ventilation in schools is so often neglected.

Paula Olsiewski: This meeting will explore next steps and priorities for the current administration.

Paula Olsiewski: it's time to improve indoor air quality in schools during an after the pandemic students, teachers and staff all deserve healthy indoor air.

Paula Olsiewski: Thank you for joining us, we have an action packed agenda we're not going to go turn over i'll turn over the meeting to our first panel which is entitled.

Paula Olsiewski: The state of ventilation in schools and the importance of healthy air during the pandemic and beyond, Dr William bonds with Professor of architectural engineering at Pennsylvania State University will moderate bill over to you.

William Bahnfleth: Thank you, Paul in this panel, we will look at the current state of indoor air quality in US schools, why is ventilation important in the fight against coven 19.

William Bahnfleth: Why is there such low awareness regarding the importance of indoor air quality.
William Bahnfleth: What action should be in the nation's top priorities in the short term and the long term, to achieve the goal of healthy indoor air and schools will over 100 billion dollars in funding supplies to address these issues.

William Bahnfleth: We will have questions and answers after the three panelists to finish the remarks, please place all your questions in the Q and a box.

William Bahnfleth: Our first panelist is miss Claire Barnett founder and executive director of healthy schools network miss Barnett is founder and executive director of the healthy schools that work the nation's premier voice for children's environmental health at school Claire over to you.

Claire Barnett: Alright, thank you.

Claire Barnett: Talk to my computer again sorry about that um I think they're just huge questions here.

Claire Barnett: I can just use questions regarding indoor air and children in schools, but to start before I get to some of the really key questions here, I want to share with you how we frame the issues around children in schools.

Claire Barnett: So, first of all it's important for all of us to agree, I think that children are not just little adults, and I think that that's pretty easy to agree to.

Claire Barnett: There are 50 million of them in public schools.

Claire Barnett: The next is that schools are not just little offices.
Claire Barnett: And it's important to understand that as well, children, uniquely involved in environmental health hazards they're still developing they can't recognize threats or articulate their exposures.

Claire Barnett: We faced a year in which there has not been timely research on the virus or, particularly on a children's age groups, school age groups.

Claire Barnett: Schools are not just little offices they're much more densely occupied than offices or even nursing homes in fact they typically used more hours per week than a normal office.

Claire Barnett: The other thing that's very different about schools is 95% of the occupants of public schools are women and children biologically very vulnerable occupants.

Claire Barnett: Before the pandemic over half of the children enrolled in public schools were Brown and black minority children and more than half were in poverty judged by participation and free and reduced price lunch programs.

Claire Barnett: it's been well documented for decades that the poorest communities often have the poor school facilities.

Claire Barnett: That means no clean air, no ventilation non working plumbing difficulties with sanitation leaks and molten legacy toxics there is absolutely no consistent funding within the states or February.

Claire Barnett: With respect to school facilities and very little if any oversight.

Claire Barnett: So, for us, we think that even though every state has compulsory education laws and understanding that school and school facilities have environmental health problems that impact.
Claire Barnett: Every child's health thinking and learning every day we're asked why is public health stopping at the schoolhouse door it’s been stopping at the school house door for a long time.

Claire Barnett: um it’s hard to understand why that happens.

Claire Barnett: When we look at the state of indoor air quality in schools, so the question is who's who's watching it, the answer is there's no tracking of children in schools.

Claire Barnett: In terms of their environmental health or their possible exposures there's also no tracking about school facilities and you see this cropping up in some of the studies that have been.

Claire Barnett: issued through mmm wr by the CDC were often the condition or the age of the facility is not taken into account when you look at a at a success or you look at some interesting other data.

Claire Barnett: The other question i've often wondered about is whether or not 100 billion dollars will address it, and the answer for us is maybe, yes, maybe, no.

Claire Barnett: And the reason for that is that it's not tied to anything and none of the bills proposing coated bailouts or rebuilding schools is.

Claire Barnett: is specifically indoor air quality and called out as a deliverable this is this makes it extra difficult on people, they have a choice.

Claire Barnett: There are all kinds of choices in education, there are a there is a plate load of education issues for everybody to deal with, and to select out one like indoor air, which is really critical.
Claire Barnett: Because everything that goes right and wrong with the building eventually gets reflected in the indoor air it's very, very difficult, there are no requirements.

Claire Barnett: there's a lot, there is not a lot of awareness about indoor air so it's really great that this is this panel is taking place.

Claire Barnett: I think one of the reasons is because EPA did once upon a time, have a very good program called indoor air quality tools for schools.

Claire Barnett: But it was zeroed out of the federal budget more than 10 years ago and when that happens, it means that we're not.

Claire Barnett: Community grants or school grants or state grants, where people were talking about the issue of indoor air.

Claire Barnett: indoor air is not a switch where you turn it off and on now I fixed it and we can walk away indoor air takes constant work so having a constant conversation in the Community or in the region really keeps the issue alive, so we were.

Claire Barnett: hopeful that CDC would do some great guidance when it began at the end of February of 2020 we found errors and confusion, starting in February of 2020.

Claire Barnett: And even recently we find difficulties and understanding how EPA, or rather how CDC is writing this in the absence of EPA guidance EPA is have big problems for a long time.

Claire Barnett: In the lack of funding and that got that got only got worse during the previous administration.

Claire Barnett: So there are there are some solutions, but I think one of the solution is to realize that, in the reopening guidance through many avenues.
Claire Barnett: The proposal is for the Federal centers for Disease Control and the education department to work together.

Claire Barnett: But in fact neither agency has a history of program or staff expertise on the physical environment of schools, and so I think we have a serious problem in terms of how to develop the right kind of guidance.

Claire Barnett: I think that’s where I want to, I want to leave this conversation, and at the moment and leave it to other people to talk more explicitly about some of the aspects of indoor air and what it does to children, thank you, Paul.

William Bahnfleth: Thank you Claire our next panelist is Dr Richard corsi dean of the College of engineering and computer science at portland State University.

William Bahnfleth: Being course he is an internationally recognized expert in the field of indoor air quality his research is motivated by the fact that the average American lives to 79 years and spent 70 of those years inside of buildings.

William Bahnfleth: And that lifetime exposure to harmful air pollution, even that about our origin is dominated by the air we breathe indoors Richard you.

Richard Corsi: Thank you bill, and I, we have to adjust that because the average American now lives to be 78 years old, not 79 years old, because of coppa 19.

Richard Corsi: The state of ventilation in general in schools in the United States is woefully inadequate I spoke with a very large school district yesterday.

Richard Corsi: That has about 3500 classrooms they’re trying their best to get ventilation up to ashtray 62.1 standard is where we should have been before the pandemic.
Richard Corsi: With no possibility of going beyond that and about 20% of their classrooms have no mechanical ventilation and have inoperable windows, so they are struggling.

Richard Corsi: With what to do and it's ventilations important because this is an airborne infectious disease.

Richard Corsi: It started as an everyone infectious disease that has been throughout, it is now and it will be in the future.

Richard Corsi: In factors emit particles that rapidly shrink and aerosol particles when they breathe speak cough and these aerosol particles are essentially the.

Richard Corsi: The rideshare or the conveyors of infectious viruses and indoor air and these aerosol particles are small enough.

Richard Corsi: That they can travel long distances, they can accumulate indoors to relatively high levels if there's an inspector, in the space over time.

Richard Corsi: And they may be inhaled and deposited in various parts of our respiratory system, this is an airborne infectious disease.

Richard Corsi: And therefore inhalation ghosts is really important, and we should spend more time talking about inhalation dose and I want to just take a brief moment here to define what that means, because ventilation is critical.

Richard Corsi: for reducing ventilation those inhalation dose is the product of four numbers for things multiplied by one another.
Richard Corsi: The first is the concentration of say virus laden particles per liter of air right we multiply that by our respiratory minute volume, which is essentially the amount of air we bring in in a minute.

Richard Corsi: and multiply that by the time we're in a space with an inspector and then multiply that by the fraction of particles that deposit in our respiratory system.

Richard Corsi: We have control, a lot of control over those first three variables concentration levels and Eric can be dramatically reduced by appropriate ventilation.

Breathing rates are important in schools, if children are going out and playing on the playground without masks or even with masks.

And then they come back into the classroom and they're breathing heavily their respiratory minute volumes, maybe 10 times what it is at rest.

So it's good to have a cool off period before kid children come back into the classroom.

Time is important right, so if we take a mask break every two hours and everybody leaves the classroom and goes outside.

And we continue to ventilate ventilations important and maybe even use filtration we can drop any virus laden particle levels in the classroom and 20 minutes down to 10% or 5%.

Richard Corsi: Of what they were when you're in the classroom and then, when you come back in it takes time for that to build back up when you integrate over the school day that gives you a pretty dramatic reduction in your inhalation dose.
Richard Corsi: inhalation dose occurs when you're in close contact with somebody in the near field.

Richard Corsi: And it happens when you're away from somebody in the same indoor space and the near field, the best way to reduce inhalation dose is universal mask wearing and physical distancing.

Richard Corsi: In the far field universal mask wearing it's important because it reduces the emissions from the infector but also reduces the concentration inside your mask.

Richard Corsi: In your breathing zone reduced inhalation toes but proper ventilation can dramatically reduce those particle concentrations, as can things like.

Richard Corsi: single zone habit filtration systems, etc, with the right combinations of these factors, we can get 10 to 20 fold reduction.

Richard Corsi: In inhalation dose 90 to 95% and I want to say this, this is really important it's easy it's not complex to do this right.

Richard Corsi: Starting with mediocre universal mass you know.

Richard Corsi: mediocre math if everybody's wearing them you're going to get a 70% inhalation dose reduction right there if you supplement that with increased ventilation, maybe a portable a half a filter where you can get effectively.

Richard Corsi: from two to six or seven interchanges per hour we're up over 90 90% over 90% inflation dose reduction there so.

Richard Corsi: We can do these things it's not rocket science and I want to say one more thing, before I end.
Richard Corsi: And I want to implore everyone, not to venture into unproven technologies that have slick marketing right ventilation, we know reduces inhalation dosed increased ventilation.

Richard Corsi: Port about half of filtration systems are approved and technology and can supplement ventilation ventilation is difficult to increase.

Richard Corsi: A portable habits and system with the Clean Air delivery rate of say 300 cubic feet per minute in a typical K through a classroom gives you sort of the equivalent of.

Richard Corsi: three to four equivalent air changes per hour if we wanted to put it in ventilation terms.

Richard Corsi: That is, in many classrooms up to 5060 70% reduction in elation dose just by switching that machine on that portable have a filtration system.

Richard Corsi: I recently did a cost analysis for the benefit of these systems capital cost recurring filter replacement costs energy costs, it turns out over a three year period.

Richard Corsi: The cost is less than $11 per student per year for that amount of ventilation dose reduction that's not per day or per week or per month that's per year.

Richard Corsi: So this is huge benefit and lowering ventilation dose by ventilation and equivalent ventilation with things like portable air cleaners, and I want to stress.

Richard Corsi: Less than $11 per student per year, that is, about two grand a frappuccino is per student per year for a dramatic reduction in relation to those with the technology that's already proven that already exist, why wouldn't we do this, thank you.
Paula Olsiewski: And now we're going to turn back over to bill so bill gets to be a moderator as well as a panelist our final panelist is Dr William bonfire.

Paula Olsiewski: So professor of architectural engineering at penn state his research interests include indoor environmental control topics.

Paula Olsiewski: Protection of building occupants from indoor air bio aerosol releases and ultraviolet germicide ul irradiation systems bill is also the Chair of ashtrays epidemic Task Force fail over to you.

William Bahnfleth: Thank you very much Paula.

William Bahnfleth: The late David foster wallace began his 2005 kenyon college commencement address by retelling an old parable.

William Bahnfleth: To young fish encounter and older fish who greets them by saying more than boys how's the water after swimming on for a bit one young fish truth, the other and asked what the hell is water.

William Bahnfleth: The story exemplifies one of the enduring difficulties based by those who understand the importance of indoor air quality they're concerned about the level of air quality in our buildings, including schools.

William Bahnfleth: As well as commented, the point of the story is that the most obvious important realities are often the ones that are the hardest to see and talk about.

William Bahnfleth: We know a number of important facts about indoor air quality, schools and covert 19.
William Bahnfleth: But unless we connect them and take appropriate action our schools will not be the safe, healthy, high quality learning environments, that we want them to be.

William Bahnfleth: The first fact is an indoor air quality has profound, albeit subtle impact on us evidence for the benefits of good indoor air quality.

William Bahnfleth: has been accumulating for decades, the cost of avoidable health and productivity losses in the US has been estimated to be hundreds of billions of dollars annually before coated.

William Bahnfleth: They can be measured in longer life lower incidence of chronic disease increased productivity and better performance of children in schools.

William Bahnfleth: Among the simplest and interventions good ventilation is associated with all of these benefits.

William Bahnfleth: Nevertheless, ventilation requirements for buildings, continue to be set at levels, based on perceived air quality essentially odor control, rather than health and performance.

William Bahnfleth: Many older school buildings are ventilated unpredictably only by opening windows and by air leakage.

William Bahnfleth: The second important fact is that the condition of school infrastructure as it relates to indoor air quality leaves much to be desired.

William Bahnfleth: A 2020 US Government Accountability Office study with the plain spoken title school districts frequently identified multiple building systems needing updates or replacement.
William Bahnfleth: found that about 54% of public school districts needed multiple system updates replacements.

William Bahnfleth: At the top of the list we're heating ventilation and air conditioning systems, with at least half of systems and the updated replacement and 41% of US school districts.

William Bahnfleth: A situation like this does not develop overnight it's been a long time in the making and is unfortunately typical of many types of buildings.

William Bahnfleth: The third fact is that the pandemic has revealed the rule rule that our buildings, including the schools can play an airborne infectious disease transmission.

William Bahnfleth: And that are existing indoor air quality standards do not address infection risk mitigation effectively.

William Bahnfleth: Numerous investigations of super spreading incidence of identified in adequate ventilation rates as a significant factor.

William Bahnfleth: And the mechanistic arguments for the importance of aerosol exposure are also in supportive this conclusion.

William Bahnfleth: Yet guidance on risk mitigation often focuses on testing contact tracing masking distancing invest vaccination and says little about basic engineering controls ventilation and filtration.

William Bahnfleth: This is particularly disturbing, given the levels of ventilation and filtration and many schools to fall short of recommendations for covert risk reduction.

William Bahnfleth: indoor air quality is highly important by many metrics are buildings, including schools aspire to a modest level of air quality that many failed to achieve.
William Bahnfleth: During the pandemic, we are reaping the consequences of that situation as we try to reopen our schools and other building safely.

William Bahnfleth: All effective risk control should be promoted implemented, including building upgrades to ensure good ventilation and filtration.

William Bahnfleth: Yes, there may be significant costs involved in some cases, but not as high as some might think, and the cost of not making that investment as much higher.

William Bahnfleth: Extensive guidance for school ventilation and filtration developed by ashtray and others provides a firm basis for developing risk mitigation strategies and should be implemented widely.

William Bahnfleth: I hope that our discussions today can contribute to bring into focus the need to upgrade air quality in our schools now and for the future.

William Bahnfleth: clarifying the cost effective technical approaches that are available for doing it and outlining and approach to support their widespread and equitable implementation.

William Bahnfleth: If we can accomplish those three things, this will have been time well spent, thank you for your participation in this important conversation.

Paula Olsiewski: Thank you bill.

Paula Olsiewski: And thank you to Claire and rich for these very thoughtful comments, I know that there are lots of questions coming in in the Q amp a box and Margaret Miller is going to start bringing them up.
Margaret Miller: Work great Thank you so much, so our first question is from Emily COP from roll call from Mrs Barnett, why was the EPA project or unhealthy schools you funded Could you elaborate on how this has impacted schools ability to respond to the pandemic.

Claire Barnett: We don’t know why they were defunded it was zeroed out in 2012.

Claire Barnett: We tried to get money restored, we really could not get a clear answer it may be, they felt that, when they had read EPA had reached a point of.

Claire Barnett: About 45 to 50% of schools self reporting, they have adopted the indoor air quality tools for schools program that 50% was enough.

Claire Barnett: So one of the ways that impacts, it is because it eliminates the conversation so when EPA is out.

Claire Barnett: Both with national cooperative agreements and regional and local grants to schools and communities and universities, there is a continuous conversation going on about indoor air indoor air is not something that you flip off and on again as you were hearing.

Claire Barnett: there’s not just one thing you do and walk away you don’t have to touch it again so it’s important to.

Claire Barnett: Keep people apprised of what’s going on, so the lack of conversation has really had a not a great effect, I think that's really been a huge problem.

Claire Barnett: And the buildings have been aging of there has not been a lot of money, since the 2008 2009 recession in fact that states and federal agencies.
Claire Barnett: Except for the stimulus to act have reduced to contributions to public education so there's no question there's a need for money in public education, there is has been for a very long time, a great need for money on school facilities.

Claire Barnett: I hope that helps.

Margaret Miller: Great Thank you and bill i’m going to help you help me assign this next one, so here’s a question from Dorothy wigmore.

Margaret Miller: it’s great to talk about children in schools schools or workplaces to what about the staff, whether it’s teachers maintenance admin staff or others.

Margaret Miller: And then can bicker and just also asked a follow up about you know it’s been reported that there are critical spreaders of school system so How does that change at all this discussion.

William Bahnfleth: yeah, I think, maybe that feeds into the earlier discussion on exposures that rich course he was was giving and you could probably elaborate on those differences in members of the school population.

Richard Corsi: yeah I don’t think it changes the strategy at all everything that I said.

Richard Corsi: For a classroom applies outside of the classroom and other parts of the school it applies to children applies to staff members, it applies to teachers replies to visitors to the school it applies to custodian.

Richard Corsi: And applies to everybody, so what we want to do is reduce inhalation dose for every, the lower the inhalation goes to lower the probability of infection.
Richard Corsi: A lower the inhalation dose it appears from from emerging evidence, the lower the the least worse, the health outcomes, even if you're infected so lowering inhalation doses key for everybody in the school community.

Claire Barnett: I would add one more comment to the question that just came in, with respect to worker protection CDC does have a hierarchy of controls that it relies on through niosh.

Claire Barnett: And, apparently, this did not influence what was happening and giving guidelines to schools.

Claire Barnett: So that would explain why we're not talking about ventilation, but we're going to be talking about a little bit of distancing but personal protective gear is lowest priority on the hierarchy of controls.

Margaret Miller: here's a question from will Jay is there a recommended resting time interval between classes as it relates to air changes per hour example 60 minutes resting time between occupying the same classroom given X air changes per hour.

William Bahnfleth: Well, it depends on what you're trying to accomplish but we've considered that perhaps three or changes uncontaminated here will remove most of the residual contamination, so if you're trying to clear the space between.

William Bahnfleth: One class leaving and another one entering and how long it takes to do that really depends on how much ventilation your system provides and.

William Bahnfleth: And what kind of supplementary filtration and air cleaning you have so it couldn’t be as little as 20 minutes if you have a really high performance system, but it could be over an hour, if you have minimum ventilation by the kinds of standards that I was talking about earlier.
Margaret Miller: Great Here are two questions for Dr corsi is your ventilation cost analysis available online and where's the evidence that you are using for the decrease in dose reduction from face coverings.

Richard Corsi: Oh so on the first one i’m speaking to 400 school superintendents and Oregon tomorrow and i’m still working in my presentation, but that analysis will be in that presentation.

Richard Corsi: I will post that tomorrow afternoon on my website, which is www dot corsi X ERS IQ COM, so you can download the slides and get the analysis there on the second question, in terms of.

Richard Corsi: In terms of dose reduction from wearing face now so that was the question was.

Richard Corsi: yeah so I mean there's there's been so much research, one of the things that's really come out of this pandemic is the value of facemasks tremendous research on the.

Richard Corsi: The efficiency and the effectiveness of well fitting facemasks and so there's just been a lot of publications on this that show that even.

Richard Corsi: You know even homemade cloth masks can get you 40% removal of efficiency for aerosol particles of the of the sides that are conveyors of the.

Richard Corsi: source code to buyers So if you take, for example, 40% reduction from the emitter and then 40% reduction for the receptor going through their mask you take 40%.

Richard Corsi: Times 40% of the remaining 60% that gets you 64% and that's a mediocre mask if we start getting the better mask it's pretty easy to get to 80% and even 90% reduction with this dual effect so.
Richard Corsi: Lots been published on masks the numbers are there and what I did is I use the lower number to get that kind of ventilation dose reduction.

Margaret Miller: Right and here's a question from Carrie Burke, is there any guidance available to informed decision making about the use of physical barriers, particularly in classrooms.

Margaret Miller: What about the balance of investment as schools have limited funds example ventilation and filtration versus using barriers.

Claire Barnett: A full plexiglass shield the sort of thing you see in the supermarket.

Claire Barnett: um that's not going to help for long term exposure, I mean if you're at the supermarket line for five or 10 minutes that's one thing, but if you're sitting in a classroom across from somebody.

Claire Barnett: it's really not workable, one of the one of the common descriptors is, if you can smell cigarette smoke from the other side of the plaques plexiglass you're also inhaling the virus.

William Bahnfleth: yeah I did that their effect is going to be very unpredictable and once you know how they interact with.

William Bahnfleth: Air movement in a space and i've also seen some studies have been closed versus open spaces that.

William Bahnfleth: show that the any attempt to really enclose areas to protect occupants from one another, actually winds up concentrating the emissions from someone who happens to be infected so it's it's pretty risky to rely on them.
Margaret Miller: Great here’s a question from Greg lemon what does this say about the use of bipolar ionization system as part of the schools HVAC system curl particulars and effective countermeasure for 19.

William Bahnfleth: You like that one rich.

Richard Corsi: Sure, so here’s what I’ll say is that I believe in in rigorous peer reviewed publications on technology.

Richard Corsi: for things like hipaa filtration and you know merv rated filters and mechanical systems there’s decades and decades of peer reviewed literature good good research, etc, and that doesn’t exist.

Richard Corsi: For technologies like needlepoint bipolar ionization there are without mentioning any companies, there are there are certainly companies that show data that look really good.

Richard Corsi: But when you break down that data it ends up being a lot, like the data, you see, for indoor plants.

Richard Corsi: Were the conditions in which the experiments are done to get these nice decay curves when you actually look at the data and you dissect the data and you back out the data.

Richard Corsi: you end up getting very low, what are called cleaner delivery rates on the order of 10 times less or 20 times less than you would get with a good old proven habit filtration system.

Richard Corsi: And so, and so you know I believe in proven technologies that have been peer reviewed published and literature analyzed by lots of people.
Richard Corsi: And that doesn't exist for a lot of the technologies that are being marketed schools, right now, and I will say I know one school district that has gone all in.

Richard Corsi: On on that particular technology, and you know there's a big question mark as to whether they spent their money wisely and I I wouldn’t have done it if I was them.

William Bahnfleth: And I would add to that, beyond efficacy, these are all technologies that are putting things into the air that aren't ordinarily there and we have to be very careful about the potential health effects there, there is some research that shows.

William Bahnfleth: oxidative stress from from high levels and production of secondary aerosols that could be hazardous so there's just a lot of work that needs to be done, we probably can really have a lot of confidence in that group of technologies.

Claire Barnett: I want to add a comment because the new technologies, ideally work in laboratory settings fathers and ministers, for example, will work ideally in.

Claire Barnett: In certain settings and can be used by scientific staff environmental cleaning staff and in large hospitals, who have some training and background on how to maintain that.

Claire Barnett: But when you go into schools you're not looking at highly trained scientific staff to manage buildings, necessarily, you may be looking at.

Claire Barnett: A Head custodian or a facility director who is remote, you may looking at a lot of people who are recently off the street without a lot of training, you may be looking at people who are handed.

Claire Barnett: disinfecting chemicals to apply to surfaces, but they're not able to read the labels or understand the labels.
Claire Barnett: So you need to think about schools very differently than you think about how products and high technology works in other kinds of settings.

Claire Barnett: I think it's a critical item, and I think it often gets missed.

Claire Barnett: And people who do want to work around schools always insist on training and education for their staff. It frankly doesn't always happen and that's why there's a potential for the misuse of high hazard chemicals in schools.

Margaret Miller: Thank you here's a question as a concerned parent of two high school students, where their district has decided to reduce physical distancing to three feet, rather than six feet.

Margaret Miller: What type of questions should I be asking about indoor air quality, I don't know what has been done to improve air quality in the high school and how they're measuring the results.

Claire Barnett: We published a list of questions back in the fall, we did a pandemic report that we released with about 22 organizations in July. It's on the on our homepage that's healthy schools.org is the pandemic versus schools and.

Claire Barnett: From that we extracted list of eight questions that we wanted any parent to ask their school and really.

Claire Barnett: Taking from what some of the better states have been doing, and the first one is to ask your school for a written policy description of what it's doing on indoor air quality.

Claire Barnett: It can be in writing, it can be an adopted policy, it's important you can ask for and receive that kind of information they may not have have it in writing, they can put it in writing.
Claire Barnett: I think these you know, these things are important local schools are local public agencies, they are tech supported and it’s perfectly fair to ask the question and to get a fair response.

Margaret Miller: Great here’s a question from a mall, how can we get this information to all schools quickly.

William Bahnfleth: One thing I would say is that a lot of organizations that are produced useful guidance have have made it publicly available, so I referenced ashtrays.

William Bahnfleth: Guidance it's on the X Ray website actually.org slash coven 19 with no dash Harvard School of Public Health has put up some really good resources on schools and her cleaners for school so.

William Bahnfleth: it's there, I think that we need to get the message out about where it can be found.

Richard Corsi: If I can add to that I i’ve been speaking with a lot of school districts in the state of Oregon.

Richard Corsi: All of them look to CDC.

Richard Corsi: So the way to disseminate quickly is to have CDC.

Richard Corsi: Be more focused on this issue.

Richard Corsi: And and there’s just a lot of confusion from folks that look at their website, when I tell them, you need to ventilate more and they said that's they say that's not what CDC is saying.
Richard Corsi: So the answer is CDC, the answer is CDC.

Richard Corsi: I'm sorry but that's what schools are looking to and that's what state health authorities are mimicking it CDC and so.

Claire Barnett: I began writing and if I hadn't written it, they would have.

Claire Barnett: looked to the education department.

Claire Barnett: Our answer actually is a.

Claire Barnett: little bit different rich and i'll suggest that the complexities are such and the different agencies have different skill sets CDC has its own skill sets within several different offices EPA several different offices education several different offices actually need a.

Claire Barnett: A federal Commission to take a hard look long term look at the strategies to get schools back on board with where their facilities, need to be.


Richard Corsi: So I completely agree i'm just telling you that right now schools are looking to CDC and they're not getting the answers to the kinds of things we're talking about they're simply not.

Richard Corsi: And that's where they're going so that's the solution right now that's, the solution is tab CDC step up.

William Bahnfleth: You agree that the sources are fragmented, that is the problem you need a.
William Bahnfleth: Central source yeah.

Margaret Miller: here's a question from Brenda vigil is adequate ventilation achieved by bringing an 18% fresh air with the fan going continuously into a classroom or which results in a complete Eric change and five hours.

Richard Corsi: No a complete air exchange and five hours is a very low air exchange rate.

Richard Corsi: That is woefully insufficient.

William Bahnfleth: More like five per hour that's.

William Bahnfleth: accounting for ventilation and filtration.

Margaret Miller: Great.

William Bahnfleth: Of course, it depends on the room to.

Margaret Miller: Can you comment on the use of CO2 monitoring help decide whether supplements to existing ventilation are recommended for infection control.

Margaret Miller: Then just more is it is it easier to just call for portable air purifiers in every space, what about districts that cannot afford this.

William Bahnfleth: Is there a proponent of CO2 measurement here.
William Bahnfleth: I, I have to say that my own experiences that CO2 can be a very misleading indicator.

William Bahnfleth: of air quality, particularly when we're operating buildings with low fractions of their intended occupancy so you may have a low CO2.

William Bahnfleth: Concentration because there's simply aren't many CO2 sources there, but it may have been a badly ventilated space to begin with, so i'm not very keen on that approach and that's X Ray has not recommended the way some have either.

Margaret Miller: Great we have a couple questions on what are your thoughts on using portable heap of pepper filters or upper room UV G I as a strategy to improve ventilation.

Margaret Miller: This was for a bell but others as well.

William Bahnfleth: Well i'll just speak to the UV piece of it, you know if you have particular spaces, where you need a high degree of protection.

William Bahnfleth: upper room UV is hard to beat it's been measured, to give the equivalent of 10s of interchanges per hour of uncontaminated air, on the other hand, it might cost.

William Bahnfleth: Many dollars per square foot and perhaps two and a half and up so it's expensive to do a whole building that way, but I think it has some very good.

William Bahnfleth: applications in high you spaces, where where people may be in a high density situations, the rich was talking about hipaa filters before I think he may have address that and maybe you have something else to add.

Richard Corsi: ya know so again for a standard 600 square foot classroom 2024 students and it's something like that a good.
Richard Corsi: portable habit filtration system with a cleaner delivery rate of 300 cubic feet per minute adds the equivalent about about three air changes per hour.

Richard Corsi: To the classroom sort of the equivalent of bringing in that much clean outdoor air so they can work really effectively and if they supplement.

Richard Corsi: ventilation and you're already at two or three air changes per hour for ventilation and you have one of these devices suddenly you're at five or six.

Richard Corsi: If you're in a classroom that doesn't have operable windows and doesn't have centralized some you know mechanical system portable habit filtration system can be golden for reducing installation so proven technology.

Richard Corsi: $11 per student per year.

Margaret Miller: Great and how do we reduce infection in school buses hallways during class change and cafeteria lunch and tables we've been talking a lot about the actual classrooms here, but how do you improve quality air quality in those spaces.

William Bahnfleth: In buses.

William Bahnfleth: Yes, that that's difficult to.

William Bahnfleth: testify to the host transportation infrastructure committee a couple of weeks ago and buses are a big problem they're not like your craft that are highly maintained and in really.
William Bahnfleth: Top line in terms of their ventilation and filtration systems, they can have very low ever change rates and poor filters and it’s just difficult opening windows in a bus and having.

William Bahnfleth: Good distancing and wearing masks in some cases may be the only workable solution with the fleet’s that we have now I think that’s a big topic for the future, as some of this investment needs to go into transport school transportation as well.

Margaret Miller: and any thoughts on cafeteria spaces.

William Bahnfleth: i’m telling them that rich right.

Richard Corsi: Well, I mean, I think that large spaces like cafeterias is where you, you know, perhaps, looking at upper room you’d be GI makes more sense than trying to apply it in every single classroom it’s smaller levels so large spaces like cafeterias and.

Richard Corsi: gyms were theater arts classrooms in high school, you know those large rooms that makes more sense than.

Richard Corsi: than it would in the classroom.

Margaret Miller: Okay, great and i’m gonna ask one more question and then there’s there’s a ton of questions, so we will hopefully get through some of these others in the panel, but then i’ll also continue to ask from this list, but um what can be used to measure indoor air quality.

Margaret Miller: what’s the best way to measure it.

William Bahnfleth: But I would say, a flow meter would be a good place to start make sure that you’ve got the amount of outdoor air that the space is.
William Bahnfleth: supposed to have you can’t do that instantaneously you know other things you can measure our particular levels.

William Bahnfleth: And and measures of specific contaminants but if we’re trying to measure our quality and from the point of view of.

William Bahnfleth: The infection control that’s pretty difficult to do right now we really have to I think pencil out whether or ventilation and filtration or providing a level of.

William Bahnfleth: protection that we want to have and then that I think is the best we can do rich may have other thoughts about better ways to do it.

Richard Corsi: Now, I think that everything it says correct, though I think one important point is.

Richard Corsi: Measuring indoor air quality well is really expensive and it’s complicated.

Richard Corsi: it’s a lot easier to measure energy use than it is to measure indoor air quality in my work with schools over the last 20 years they get energy use, they can see it in their bills, they can see the kilowatt hours.

Richard Corsi: have no clue how to measure indoor air quality and they certainly don’t have the resources, nowhere close to the resources to do it appropriately, so I agree with bill I think we’re stuck with sort of these bulk.

Richard Corsi: Bulk measures, which is just the amount of airflow to a classroom the you know the the ventilation rates of classrooms.

Margaret Miller: Great now we can transition over to the second panel.
281
00:42:28.560 --> 00:42:29.490
Margaret Miller: i’ll hand it to you.

282
00:42:30.000 --> 00:42:30.540
Paula Olsiewski: Okay well.

283
00:42:31.980 --> 00:42:49.200
Paula Olsiewski: thanks again to our panel from session one we now turn to us a second session so first of all I want to thank all of the people we have 53 questions in that in the Q amp a i’ve been looking at the chat there’s a lot of.

284
00:42:50.370 --> 00:43:06.810
Paula Olsiewski: lot of comments in there that maybe but long in the Q amp a but I i’m really grateful that to our whole the whole day of panelists because clearly a conversation on indoor air in schools is necessary, so now let’s turn over to panel to.

285
00:43:07.710 --> 00:43:18.210
Paula Olsiewski: Technical solutions to improve indoor air quality in schools, Dr Anna rule assistant professor of environmental, health and engineering at Johns Hopkins Bloomberg public.

286
00:43:19.320 --> 00:43:23.520
Paula Olsiewski: Bloomberg School of Public Health will moderate this panel and over to you.

287
00:43:25.620 --> 00:43:26.520
Ana Rule: Thank you Paula.

288
00:43:27.570 --> 00:43:35.220
Ana Rule: In these panel so in the panel, we will discuss if portable a hipaa air filters can be used to improve indoor air quality.

289
00:43:36.150 --> 00:43:50.250
Ana Rule: What is the potential role of carbon dioxide monitor in the classroom so I guess, we will continue the discussion How can he operates improve indoor air quality, why are energy efficient buildings, not necessarily the best for indoor air quality.

290
00:43:51.390 --> 00:43:58.080
Ana Rule: Why is there such a strong focus on hygiene products, instead of integration solutions what actions should.
Ana Rule: should be the nation's top priorities in the short term and the long term, to achieve the goal of healthy indoor air in schools, we will take questions.

Ana Rule: Again, from the audience after the three panelists have given, given their remarks, please keep putting your questions in the Q amp a box.

Ana Rule: Our first panelist is Dr Brent Stevens department, Chair of Professor of civil like architectural and environmental engineering at Illinois Institute of Technology he's an expert in indoor air quality and building science Brent over to you.

Brent Stephens: Great, thank you for the introduction and so to answer some of these questions I think we've already touched on a lot of these things to rich and bill.

Brent Stephens: so rich and bill already covered, you know, really, the importance of ventilation and air cleaning and schools broadway for for indoor air quality and, of course, including the transmission a coven.

Brent Stephens: Also, the importance of understanding inhalation does have a pathogen ways to reduce it and so on.

Brent Stephens: And I completely agree with rich that this is largely not a super complex issue, you know that we largely know what to do, from a technical standpoint.

Brent Stephens: You know, we largely know that mask wearing and distancing even not very good masks can have a big impact on short range or near field transmission.

Brent Stephens: And then we know that you know washing hands and periodic service cleaning can address contaminated services, to the extent that that's important in some environments.
Brent Stephens: And then, of course, we know that we can additionally address aerosol or small droplet transmission by wearing masks as well.

Brent Stephens: We can wear better mass way to improve ventilation, improve air cleaning or filtration, and so one thing that I think is really key to point out here is that to think of all the solutions as part of.

Brent Stephens: You know, a layered approach to risk reduction as it’s often called if if you haven’t seen sort of the Swiss cheese model, which was written up in the New York Times several weeks ago.

Brent Stephens: it’s a really good way to think about this, I think, where you have these layers of control or layers of potential risk reduction.

Brent Stephens: in place, and most of those are technical solutions, some are not but that’s important because risk reduction for one can be additive like like rich talked about.

Brent Stephens: And then, for two if you lose a layer you lose a slice, if you will, the whole system doesn’t fail right, so this is true and infection controls and it’s it’s true in civil engineering it’s true in lots of areas.

Brent Stephens: And so, when I think about this, you know, for example, kids and teachers to that to you know as well you know can’t keep their mass on necessarily all the time.

Brent Stephens: And although I would I would mention that, personally, my my kids are age two and four they’ve been in daycare since July.

Brent Stephens: And i’d be happy to talk about some of the personal decisions we’ve made there, but i’m amazed at how well they can actually keep their mass on better than.
Brent Stephens: Most most of us adults actually it's kind of a game to them.

Brent Stephens: But anyway, so kids and teachers can't keep their mass on all the time right so cafeteria spaces were mentioned, for example, if you got to eat you've got to drink.

Brent Stephens: When you're at school, so ventilation and air cleaning on top of mass on top of distancing.

Brent Stephens: is important for an additive risk reduction and also for just when you can't you know when one of those layers fails.

Brent Stephens: So, speaking of ventilation, I think another really key thing to think about is that we've heard a lot about target rates and we've.

Brent Stephens: heard a lot about air changes per hour, so if you're not super familiar with these terms you've heard three air changes per hour 600 changes per hour it's just the rate of turnover or dilution of a pollutant in space, and so I think what's important is that.

Brent Stephens: You can achieve this by ventilation, bringing an outside air uncontaminated air, you can achieve it by air cleaner filtration.

Brent Stephens: And those these can be added this right, so if you're in a space that has a central you know classroom where the central system.

Brent Stephens: Do what actually recommends upgrade the filter to move 13 or as high as you can get you know i've done a lot of filter testing in my career and if you can get that in a classroom that's great, we also know.

Brent Stephens: From what we heard earlier, that a lot of classrooms are not centrally heated and cooled or ventilated and you have much.
Brent Stephens: Less capability to make impacts, with a central system and so.

Brent Stephens: You know, then comes you know portable air cleaners, and the like, and so what are what are good target rates, you know you can look to health care facilities 12 interchanges per hour is like a.

Brent Stephens: Is a is a is a pretty standard modern healthcare facility that that's a great goal if you could try to get that if you could get six air changes per hour, if you can get 500 changes per hour or something near that you know I think those are still really.

Brent Stephens: quite reasonable risk reduction numbers on top of.

Brent Stephens: The other the other parts of the of the Swiss cheese layers and then I just want to reiterate, maybe two things one is that.

Brent Stephens: I do think it's very important to avoid additive technic technical solutions for air cleaning or air purification or however it's marketed.

Brent Stephens: there's a long history of problems in this space and there's plenty potential for the technologies being either ineffective.

Brent Stephens: Or, causing harm through byproduct formation or both, and so you know we we have a paper hopefully coming out in the next few days.

Brent Stephens: Testing one of these products that shows and minimal effectiveness and actually generation of some volatile organic compounds in a way that we suspected, and it was there and I also just kind of want to mention that look i’m an engineer.

Brent Stephens: And I think like an engineer, but i’m also a parent and i’m in Chicago.
Brent Stephens: In the middle of a fight between the mayor and the Chicago teachers Union on how to safely return and I get that it's complicated and I feel like what has happened in in this in this last year is that, whatever your baseline level of anxiety or risk perception is it seems amplified like in the direction it was already in and so there's a lot of decisions, people are tired of making decisions.

Brent Stephens: I would really hope to see you know I find myself encouraged when I see things like the hairdresser study in Missouri from the summer that were a hairdresser was cold positive but wore masks the whole time and so 100 clients, or whatever and and so on, so I think we need to see more like success stories and failure stories.

Brent Stephens: You know our own university reopened and I was pretty skeptical this fall how it would go frankly it went a little it went better than I thought you know.

Brent Stephens: Why is that what can we learn from these you know where's the where's the national grocery store workers study right that that that.

Brent Stephens: explores you know these these central spaces that have been open for for such long times what can we learn from those I hope to see more on that.

Brent Stephens: So with that i'll close and handed over.

Ana Rule: Thank you Brent.

Ana Rule: Our next panelist is Mr Simon Turner Simon CEO of building cognition a consulting firm specializing in inner quality.
Ana Rule: Simon has a background in biology and his interest for the past few years has been the impact of buildings under features on human cognition and health. Simon over to you.

Simon Turner: Thank you and thank you Paula for setting this whole event up. It's been very interesting so far. So appreciate it, yes, I spent 30 years working for, and eventually leading an indoor environmental consulting firm.

Simon Turner: Focusing very much an indoor air quality 30 years in the trenches, if you like.

Simon Turner: Working for a who's who of commercial real estate owners and operators, as well as school universities theaters all kinds of different built environments, but I sold the company now so, to be honest, I have no skin in the game shorter some advisory board roles.

Simon Turner: Safe traces for us as a diagnostic technique, but, basically, I can tell you what I think what no one telling me what what I should say.

Simon Turner: And so you know i’ll tell it like it is to extend that I can, let me start by saying we’re fighting a war here, obviously it’s a while we haven’t for a long time, probably Spanish flu in.

Simon Turner: 1918 was the biggest large war, we fought in this regard, although there have been other outbreaks, obviously.

Simon Turner: But, like the military, we tend to fight the last war with the tools and techniques and the challenges we face, rather than the next one, so you know next time we have a pandemic, maybe the.

Simon Turner: Worst victims are the biggest victims will be young people rather than older people, maybe next time it'll be phone lights, rather than aerosol transmission, we have to worry about we just don't know.
Simon Turner: So you know I thought, what I would talk about a little bit about what I would do if I was a policymaker.

Simon Turner: Because if I was i’m always grateful i’m not frankly right understand i’d have to work, the odds here that i’m dealing with millions of people and their lives.

Simon Turner: And I can’t control them all, especially in a country as diverse as United States and to understand that really the you know the perfect is the enemy of the good of good you can only.

Simon Turner: Do, so much so, what policies we do end up with should be broad strategic themes which have been proven to be successful program to be robust and resilient.

Simon Turner: But give us the biggest bang for the buck, and of course this is why we come down to ventilation in particular it’s really a question of playing the odds a triage maximizing the odds of success, and so in that regard, I agree with a lot of what Richard cause he said in particular here.

Simon Turner: But here’s a few nuggets to take away from this based on my experience at least over three decades.

Simon Turner: Buildings are very complicated and generally by and large, with the exception of school trailers probably they’re all different they’re always like each one is an experiment.

Simon Turner: They change by the hour by the day, depends on how they oriented it depends on internal and external eat loads, especially in schools where you have you know, an empty classroom we know internal heat load and then.

Simon Turner: 2530 kids running i’m a heater and it’s very difficult for inexpensive air conditioning system to manage those rapidly changing he blows.
Simon Turner: And, as both been a challenge for schools, unless they're the.

Simon Turner: district has a budget that can really throw a lot of money and healthy control systems, how they're configured, and in particular the complexities of turbulence and add movement inside schools.

Simon Turner: or any room for that matter is is a real challenge so coming back to actually do what Richard Richard said there's an old industrial hygiene maxim, and that is it's the dose makes the poison.

Simon Turner: The more you're exposed and the more time you're exposed to that level, the more likely it will hurt you.

Simon Turner: dependent, at the same whether you're dealing with a chemical contaminants in a room or you're dealing with an infectious contamination.

Simon Turner: So, really, what we need to aim for is the lowest concentration that's feasible for the shortest period of time, the inhalation dose as, as we heard from from rich causey.

Simon Turner: We can’t produce a sterile environment and actually nor should we but and there's probably a threshold number of viral particles, that if you can get below you won't have to worry so much about infection.

Simon Turner: We don’t really know what that threshold is and it's going to vary depending on the individual obviously so again if I was a policymaker it's about playing the odds.

Simon Turner: So imagine imagine there is an infectious person person in the room, and there are really two components to consider one is the background concentration.
Simon Turner: of infectious particles in the surrounding air assuming it was perfectly next which course it never is.

But the second and probably most important one that can make the biggest difference.

Is the concentration of infectious particles in the expelled plume from that infected person right here in front of their mouths and right there in in your breathing zone, and this is why you see so much.

Infections really from people in close quarters, especially important ventilated spaces, going from their breathing zone to your it's all about your local breathing zone and that's where you want to get infectious particles out so that local ventilation is critical.

There are two main benefits to ventilation, first of all, it gets beneficial components of outdoor and indoor spaces.

And it dilutes the bad indoor internally generated pollutants that that build up in the indoor space Okay, but there's another big benefit we actually haven't touched on yet.

Today, and that is there are and have been over some years.

Clear and convincing studies that show that bringing outside air into a space and lowering carbon dioxide levels improves cognitive function and the ability of people of all ages to learn.

It's a really important thing we have very clear evidence of that now and that really was a game changer as I became more public knowledge about how it can improve cognitive function.
Simon Turner: So the ventilation strategies, I believe, in which work in order of cost would be first where you can where you have a climate and the ability to do it.

Simon Turner: Open windows and create and doors and create cross flows across rooms, to the extent that you can and no it's not possible in some rooms and in some climates depends on the time of year.

Simon Turner: Second thing indoor fans and mixing I a believer in just mixing the room, the room air up if because it's a cheap inexpensive way of doing it and it helps to disperse that.

Simon Turner: Infectious droplet plume in front of infected people next, of course, is mechanical outdoor air delivery.

Simon Turner: Which is one of the things that's missing from hung's a lot of people, to my surprise don't understand how poorly ventilated homes are.

Simon Turner: and, obviously, the more outside air, you can bring in the better it is now there's an energy penalty associated with that which is very going to be very interesting in the years to come, because.

Simon Turner: we've done as we heard earlier, everyone knows what it costs to bring outside Aaron and there's been all this effort to reduce the energy consumption of buildings.

Simon Turner: But what we're going to end up with is an ethical debate about the value of reducing energy costs if it means and compromising the cognitive ability of the people who work in those spaces and learning those spaces.

Simon Turner: And that's something which will be interesting to see how that pans out turns out over the coming years.
Simon Turner: And then the last and most expensive strategy for ventilation, which I'm a big believer in is a concept called thermal displacement ventilation.

Simon Turner: Now it's not something you could just retrofit into an existing building, because it really means turning the whole ventilation system upside down. The concept just briefly is you bleed air into the floor space or room at low level, you have big diffusers a poor Aaron about 65 degrees and they form a pool of cooler on the floor and they rely on the thermal clunes from equipment and kids and teachers.

Simon Turner: Floor space or room at low level, you have big diffusers a poor Aaron about 65 degrees and they form a pool of cooler on the floor and they rely on the thermal clunes from equipment and kids and teachers.

Simon Turner: Come up around the individual delivering clean air conditioned air into the breathing zones of the individuals and then.

Simon Turner: Out of the breathing zone into the returner or exhaust system. It's highly energy efficient and it's really good and limiting that cross.

Simon Turner: Contamination from one individual to another, and there are examples of thermal displacement all over the country but it's not anywhere near as popular in this country, as it is in Europe.

Simon Turner: I think one of the things we could do is try to encourage thermal displacement systems in new construction again it's difficult to do an existing building, again I got no dog in the thermal displacement hunt, but I think it's a very effective method, if we can use it where we can.

Simon Turner: So, finally, my personal research recommendations in this field are come back to an old business maxim that I used to use when I was running a business you can't manage what you don't measure.

Simon Turner: So I'm a big believer in using the science of epidemiology, the power of statistics over large sample sizes to pick out the best of these engineering techniques.
Simon Turner: and understand what really does work, what does limit infections and what you know, maybe sounds nice by our gut but we don’t really know so then we don’t squander these billions potentially available dollars to us to get it right, thank you.

Ana Rule: Thank you, Simon.

Ana Rule: Our final panelist is Dr tofino farmer associate professor of chemistry at Colorado State University.

Ana Rule: Research focuses on outdoor atmospheric and indoor chemistry, with an emphasis on understanding the sources and sings of reactive trace gases and particles and their effects on climate, ecosystems and human health Sophie over to you.

Delphine Farmer: Thank you, thank you and I want to thank all the panelists who spoken before me, who, I think it really laid a fantastic.

Delphine Farmer: piece of groundwork and explaining the need for ventilation masking and distancing and I think that's really well established.

Delphine Farmer: So what I want to use my next few minutes to do is to provide my perspective, as a chemist on some of these issues.

Delphine Farmer: So I think the first, the first thing that we've sort of alluded to over the last.

Delphine Farmer: The last hour or so is that there there's an established need to ventilate but there's also a lot of focus on surface, cleaning and on hygiene.

Delphine Farmer: And so I want to talk about the cat the challenge of that first and then I want to talk about chemical the challenges of chemical approaches to airplane.
Delphine Farmer: So hiking products and surface cleaning are being widely used in schools, but they do have to serious problems.

Delphine Farmer: The first of which is that surface cleaning isn't actually very useful in terms of bang for the buck in covert 19 surface transmission is not the dominant mode of transmission in most environments and so.

Delphine Farmer: I think there's first, a question of money and how you choose to spend your your dollars um but the second.

Delphine Farmer: challenge with surface cleaning, which lays the groundwork for some other things I want to mention.

Delphine Farmer: Is that there are real problems with excessive cleaning in terms of health effects both from the cleaners themselves, but also the chemistry that they create.

Delphine Farmer: As well as material damage, environmental issues, and then a series of chemical reactions that a lot of disinfectants start.

Delphine Farmer: And this can create a very complex cocktail of different compounds and indoor air, many of which are toxic.

Delphine Farmer: And so there's there's an array of comes through that will happen moment you bring a reactive compound into an environment, and I think we.

Delphine Farmer: we're not talking about those chemical consequences enough when we talk about surface clean.
Delphine Farmer: So, while some of the surface cleaners are certainly effective and have been proven by EPA testing to be effective in terms of destroying everything starting coming to virus on surfaces.

Delphine Farmer: that's not the biggest problem in this pandemic right now, and so I think we, we need to consider the unintended chemical consequences of surface, cleaning and they're toxic byproducts, particularly for janitorial staff, as well as for children and adults.

Delphine Farmer: So they're very real consequences of overclaiming but what I wanted to the other thing I wanted to bring about is that the same idea here of.

Delphine Farmer: unintended chemical consequences also applies to a lot of new air cleaning devices so there's a.

Delphine Farmer: series of new air cleaning devices that are being very aggressively promoted, some of them use accidents like ozone hydroxyl radicals you'll talk of see.

Delphine Farmer: Discussions of photo catalytic devices what those really are doing is breaking down molecules and pathogens, but in doing so, they produce a series of oxidized organic compounds and this has been the study of decades of research and atmospheric chemistry.

Delphine Farmer: You produce formaldehyde among other other toxic, and so I think we really need to think about that unintended chemistry.

Delphine Farmer: spraying and fogging of disinfectants like hydrochloric acid hydrogen peroxide ethylene glycol is also bring that same level of new chemical reactions into an already complex indoor environment.

Delphine Farmer: And then finally there's a set of products called Ionized or Ion generators, and these devices that again becoming.
Delphine Farmer: quite common in the marketplace, but they use chemistry that as a chemist as a physical chemist I understand i'm molecule reaction create oxidized organic compounds in the atmosphere.

Delphine Farmer: And, and some of those are toxic and have unintended chemical consequences there's very little independent oversight and testing these.

Delphine Farmer: Of these products and very little consideration of the secondary chemistry so as an environmental chemist, I would like to put for you, the idea of the precautionary principle.

Delphine Farmer: And what we know works is ventilation infiltration and I think doctors corsi and fun fluff and and Stevens of all provided, among others, are provided excellent advice on on that.

Delphine Farmer: So I think we need to also consider when we bring in chemical devices.

Delphine Farmer: What are we exposing people, particularly children too and and why would we do that when we don't even need to when there are other much more benign and less expensive approaches.

Delphine Farmer: So overall my team messages are first off skip the comments what anything chemical you don't need it.

Delphine Farmer: And that's that's me coming into kind of and, secondly, clear the air with ventilation filtration source control with masking and social So those are my thoughts and i'll be be happy to participate in the discussion.

Ana Rule: Thank you so much, Dr farmer Paula over to you.

Ana Rule: Oh.
Paula Olsiewski: Sorry, I was muted okay so Margaret I assume we looks like we're getting a lot more questions.

Margaret Miller: Great so we have a lot of questions it'll be similar but they're kind of technical and specific, so I think it shows that there's still a lot of questions out here about this and guidance needed so.

Margaret Miller: here's a question from Laura Palmer we have one campus housing and other older building with oil lucky and window air conditioning.

Margaret Miller: Units they're on a limited budget from her understanding, should we upgrade to window AC units that bring an outdoor air upgrade filters and AC units invest in hipaa air purifiers and open windows to air outside space.

Margaret Miller: How will we know we've done enough to mitigate risk and then prove indoor air quality and would you recommend the habit air filters and upgrading window AC units to bring in outdoor air to mitigate risks.

Simon Turner: We can take a shot up that, if you like, the thing about window units will bang, as we call them in the industry is that they just don't have the power to run have a filters.

Simon Turner: So you're going to have to if you're going to run half of filters through small window basically you're going to have to do all kinds of upgrades to.

Simon Turner: A more powerful system that can handle the pressure drop pepper filters a big strong pressure drops, it is a myth that you can just install have a filters everywhere and every air handler.

Simon Turner: You can't fake that as a limit So yes to a lot of the questions that she's asking about improve ventilation, improved for Tracy extent you can.
Simon Turner: But any air handler is going to have a limit the amount of filtration you can put in it, and that was really intriguing question she just asked was a she right was when do you know when you've done enough that's a really good question.

Simon Turner: I don't have the answer that, and this is why I said about managing what you measure we need more epidemiology to know what we really need to know what really works and what sounds good, but it doesn't really work, and that requires the study of disease that's what epidemiology means.

Brent Stephens: I just want to add on a couple things on that because I I heard window unit to bring in more outside air and I just most of the window units that you can use.

Brent Stephens: Either don’t bring any outside air or they bring in just a tiny amount just a little amount, so it actually wouldn’t increase ventilation, that much if you need it because the classroom is going to be hot, then they get it.

Brent Stephens: And then, so, in addition to that, it sounds again to co sign it, it sounds like a solid use of a portable you know or standalone air cleaning unit and for I would say, for a lot of these if you're unsure what to what to.

Brent Stephens: use their I want to point you to the US EPA is guide for air cleaners and filtration in the home.

Brent Stephens: The in the home part could probably be erased from that document because it's very general and.

Brent Stephens: So you’ll learn things like what’s it what’s a what’s a reasonable clean air delivery rate for what size space just take that number, you know what spaces it size for and and increase and increase it right, maybe double it for schools, something like that.
Brent Stephens: So yeah I think that’s important add.

Margaret Miller: Great and here’s a question from Progress dokey and what is the panel’s opinion on the relative importance of droplet transmission verse aerosol transmission such a situation where the people are close to each other, but the filters chugging away decide that.

Simon Turner: that’s something i’m concerned about in that you have you know you have to have a filter out there, lowering the background levels, but this was something I was trying to say during my talk that.

Simon Turner: And a lot of the you know it really infectious episode infection episodes is probably happening face to face right there in front of people within a few feet.

Simon Turner: And that you, although you're learning the background levels, with a hyper filters, this is why the ventilation component so important to try to disperse.

Simon Turner: Those concentrations of heavier aerosols before they make it into your breathing zona.

Simon Turner: At numbers which cause infection that's the challenge obviously it's, not to say you shouldn't reduce the background levels would happen filter in the corner, but we have to understand that a lot of this infection is happening face to face within a few feet of each other.

Margaret Miller: Right now i'll do a little bit of a follow up on that one um can you speak to the impact of room airflow patterns on the ventilation effectiveness of in Room peppa filter units where should we be placing these filters.

Simon Turner: Right, you will take that.
458
01:11:02.070 --> 01:11:12.420
Brent Stephens: yeah that's a hard one to generalize right unless you unless you offer such high level advice that it's almost meaningless and that you could have told me the answer right.

459
01:11:13.170 --> 01:11:21.690
Brent Stephens: Which is well it works better, when it's near the source, but well how do you know what your sources well you don't and so it's tricky.

460
01:11:22.500 --> 01:11:33.750
Brent Stephens: And again, I think it reiterates like the importance of this hierarchy of controls, because some of this stuff you just can't know without a really deep investigation and and where's that going to come from.

461
01:11:34.990 --> 01:11:44.700
Brent Stephens: And another sort of way to think about it in my mind is relatively evenly spaced among people is probably a reasonable approach.

462
01:11:45.990 --> 01:11:55.740
Brent Stephens: And then you know you I haven't seen any studies of this, but you may find comfort in units that.

463
01:11:56.820 --> 01:12:07.200
Brent Stephens: push air in a way that that that encourages mixing, for example, I you know again this is sort of assignments point like we probably need to learn more air but.

464
01:12:07.530 --> 01:12:13.770
Brent Stephens: You know, as it pulls air from below and pushes up to the top, for example, it may encourage mixing more so than like a directional airflow.

465
01:12:14.850 --> 01:12:18.750
Brent Stephens: But it's really hard to say much more than that.

466
01:12:20.280 --> 01:12:33.450
Simon Turner: becomes better what I was saying about every room is different, as how its configured pencils in it and it depends who's infected and who is infectious in it and that's going to vary room by room hour by hour, especially in schools.
Margaret Miller: Great Thank you and here’s a question for Dr farmer or they’re growing concerns about over disinfection with sprays and floggings and the effect of the chemicals on respiratory health.

Delphine Farmer: there’s what we know about the chemistry, is it both a lot of these fogging and disinfection units, the compounds that are being used themselves will react with.

Delphine Farmer: The tissues of your lungs and the cells inside to create an array of toxic byproducts that we know are dangerous so so we know that that is a problem, but what we also know is that when those.

Delphine Farmer: Bogging and disinfecting compounds like hydrochloric acid and hydrogen peroxide are released into a room, they will then react with.

Delphine Farmer: gases in the air, you know all the things that we can smell, and we know are off gassing off with painter wood or we're just exhaling.

Delphine Farmer: And and there again we create that array of toxic byproducts through chemical reactions and breathing, that is, is of great concern So yes, there are a lot of concerns about people breathing in.

Delphine Farmer: During active disinfection or fogging events, but also what happens.

Delphine Farmer: hours later, if people return into the room, and you have had chemical reactions occurring on all the surfaces inside your room, they will still continue to off gas.
Delphine Farmer: Those toxic compounds, so we have a lot of concerns about those in the chemistry and indoor air communities and a lot of concerns about the lack of oversight or capacity to really think about that chemistry.

Margaret Miller: Great and are your recommendations regarding ozone emitting purifies roughly the same as I a new station devices, how to users of ozone program purifier sorry ensure they're not exceeding recommended indoor ozone levels.

Delphine Farmer: So I'll flat out say there's no safe level of ozone to breathe in there's no safe level of any of those stones oxidizer to breathe, and they will all react again with the tissues in your lungs and.

Delphine Farmer: and create not only do direct damage but also create toxic products so there's no safe level, so I cannot in any way, shape or form recommend anything that produces ozone.

Delphine Farmer: They may be called air purifiers, but that does not actually mean that they are healthy or create healthier air that's a complete.

Delphine Farmer: Complete difference in terminology and, similarly, I and either is, I think, also as as Dr bond fluff mentioned earlier.

Delphine Farmer: And, and as well as Prince Stevens, and our session there's there's emerging evidence that they are dangerous to human health, and so I again I don't think there is any good level which she can use them.

Simon Turner: I would.

Simon Turner: I would echo what delfin said that about ozone generators, in fact I think last time I looked there is a weathering critique of ozone generators on the EPA website somewhere, which should put that the match of the rest.
Margaret Miller: Right here's a question from John Cox, who oversees the claims assertions of commercial indoor air quality products in the United States.

Simon Turner: I'm going to say no one Brent.

Brent Stephens: I see Bill and Rich here if you guys want to chime in at all at the short of a loose that EPA doesn't do a lot there's a number of industry or professional societies that they do some but frankly there's not enough that they can do at this point in my opinion.

Delphine Farmer: Yeah I'd like to see organizations like the Food and Drug Administration be involved, but I.

Delphine Farmer: The regulatory world is beyond beyond my understanding on that.

Margaret Miller: Okay, great um here's a question from Carrie Burke, can you discuss the impact of humidity in the north, east, the relative humidity in our buildings can fall to the 20s or the teens.

Simon Turner: Well, I mean we see, I mean humidity varies from place to place in the country and, from the time of year, and one of the things I will counsel against is installing humidifiers into indoor air to try to raise humidity it's bad idea, but they can bring their own problems.

Simon Turner: You know, air conditioning systems tend to control humanity in in hot summer environments and it's all about letting them do their job, having the right vapor barrier to place.

Simon Turner: And the right, so you don't create mold issues, in particular, that this is what comes of humidity if it's not controlled properly you end up with with with mold issues and conversation leading to more so.
Simon Turner: yeah I don't think you can go too overboard trying to control humanity, ideally, want to keep it between 30 and 60%.

Margaret Miller: rate is changing a habit filters by an untrained person does that carry any risk to contaminate the area, the classroom.

Brent Stephens: I think that there's relatively minimal risk and changing filters I do like the idea of.

Brent Stephens: i've seen that I think it was destined popping didn't get nist mentioned this idea of like changing them on a Monday morning after.

Brent Stephens: Any captured viruses, you know, had was rich had time to decay, you know, over the weekend and then it's a pretty simple process to place you know where people in place into.

Brent Stephens: A trash bag and get it out of there, so I don't think it's much more complex than that.

Margaret Miller: Okay, great I have a few more questions for the session and then we'll push them to the next session um how effective is an outward facing box fan and an outside open door for reducing pollution dose and are their potential negative implications are each back system or inside air pressure.

Simon Turner: But by and large, in it, I mean assuming you're talking about a main built school building rather than a than a trailer building.

Simon Turner: It what we generally do not want to do is create a negative pressure in a building.
Simon Turner: You want the air conditioning system to generate a mild positive pressure that the air the outside air come in through the air handler so the building is under a positive pressure the downside of putting exhaust at throwing in additional exhaust fans.

Simon Turner: Country to the design intent of the building is that you create negative pressure now you’re calling in.

Simon Turner: outdoor air from uncontrolled sources, which could include parking lots trash compactor as loading docks all kinds of them uncontrolled sources so.

Simon Turner: Again it’s best to let the air handlers do that job, make sure using ashtray these affray recommendations that are now out there that are excellent, by the way to maximize ventilation, using the mechanical equipment that you have.

Simon Turner: And, by all means use natural ventilation, where you can but I wouldn’t install this water sounds like he’s talking about negative and machines, to create a negative pressure inside the school bad idea.

Margaret Miller: Okay, great um two more questions so.

Margaret Miller: I don't think most of us understand upper room UV GI How should we start researching this ventilation strategy and what are the criteria, in addition to cost to consider before implementation.

Simon Turner: Once you take that Brent i’ve got a common attitude, but when you guys take it.

Brent Stephens: Are we okay with crossing paths here because bill bomb classes on here, but his video he should do this yeah.

Paula Olsiewski: It feels available world’s experts on.
Brent Stephens: This, I can tell you a bill would say.

William Bahnfleth: Surely Where would you get started, or two chapters in the ashtray handbook on upper room and CDC approves upper maybe GI for tuberculosis controls was actually a whole niosh technical guide on applying.

William Bahnfleth: upper room system so that that's a good place to start you know if you're not going to dig into the literature and there's an ashtray best practices article as well, so there's a lot of infrared information around and mainly comes from.

William Bahnfleth: The sources and Harvard has done most of the research that i'm aware of on upper room systems over the years and to make a lesser extent Colorado Those are all good places to search for information.

Margaret Miller: Great and then anybody else on that comment.

Simon Turner: Right I.

Margaret Miller: think you had one more comment and then i'll go to our last question for the session.

Brent Stephens: yeah thanks I also just wanted to make sure that I was in the question about where do I put a portable air cleaner in a classroom or a portable air cleaners in a classroom.

Brent Stephens: I want to revisit that because I think what I said was too complex, the answer is, I don't really know the answer is put it anywhere, you can place it in the classroom and it will.
Brent Stephens: have a positive impact, most likely right, so I wanted to I have we have a tendency to overcomplicate things and While that may be true just put it anywhere put it, where the people are, and you can have an impact, so I don’t know if others have any comment on that.

Margaret Miller: Thanks for clarifying that was great that’s great Okay, so the last question for this panel which can go to everyone i’m sure, but will stick to this panel when balancing budgets what recommendation would you provide us to focusing on air quality versus surface cleaning.

Simon Turner: Oh ventilation, but that’s an easy one, and there’s we’ve seen comments already here and elsewhere about theater of surface, cleaning and I personally am.

Simon Turner: In that camp, but I think it’s a bit of a kabuki dance at the surface cleaning that we know about this pandemic today, is it it isn’t so much fun mites as aerosol transmission, so if I had to a limited budget, my first priority would be outside.

Delphine Farmer: yeah I completely agree ventilation and filtration and and and I would not spend excessive amounts of money on on on fancy surface disinfection a lot of a lot of very simple things work.

Delphine Farmer: The EPA has a whole list end of different disinfecting civil work on surfaces and soap and water is is is one of them, and a lot less expensive than then a lot of other options, so I think ventilation filtration.

Delphine Farmer: that’s for this pandemic, I think, someone mentioned, maybe, maybe there will be another one that that hopefully we will not all experience, but in that case, that would need to be reevaluated for but for coven 19 it’s really about airborne transmission.

Paula Olsiewski: or.

Margaret Miller: Back to you.
Paula Olsiewski: Alright well.

Paula Olsiewski: I want to thank again this panel, done a great job really interesting discussion and so now we're going to move on to our our third panel.

Paula Olsiewski: And the final session is using policy and other supportive mechanisms to implement healthy air in schools and Dr Ken Bernard former special assistant to the US President for bio Defense and former assistant surgeon general will moderate this panel can over to you.

Ken Bernard: Thanks Paul i’m in this panel will discuss the roles of the federal state local governments, what are the roles of teachers parents and stakeholders.

Ken Bernard: How can we ensure that investments lead to healthy indoor air and are sustained long term.

Ken Bernard: How can schools, be supported in the implementation of policies in terms of acquisition use and upkeep of these new resources cost benefit analysis, what action should.

Ken Bernard: be the nation’s top priorities in the short term and long term, in order to achieve the goal of healthy indoor air in schools, so big subject, obviously, and I guarantee, we will not come up with a set of perfect answers but let’s start off with our first panelist.

Ken Bernard: Dr Chris Pike he’s senior Vice President of Arc score route incorporated he’s a principal investigator for the Green health partnership.

Ken Bernard: A long term research and initiative prior to joining our Chris was research officer for the US green building Council street chief strategy officer for a climber, and chief operating officer for GR ESB in a physical scientist with the US.
540
01:25:24.960 --> 01:25:27.540
Ken Bernard: Environmental Protection Agency Chris.

541
01:25:27.630 --> 01:25:29.370
Ken Bernard: Over to you alright.

542
01:25:30.090 --> 01:25:33.870
Chris Pyke: Thank you again it's been a pleasure listening to the dialogue today and I.

543
01:25:34.230 --> 01:25:41.520
Chris Pyke: I want to, I want to build on the program and say first of all, I appreciate the opportunity to be here second i’m an environmental scientist and my work focuses on.

544
01:25:41.790 --> 01:25:50.820
Chris Pyke: Promoting providing building spaces and places that benefit people in the environment and so today i’m going to talk to you about our perspective on.

545
01:25:51.240 --> 01:25:58.920
Chris Pyke: How we are advancing indoor environmental quality for schools, how we are fostering a coven re entry and what’s going on with our perspective on indoor air.

546
01:25:59.280 --> 01:26:06.420
Chris Pyke: And so, today we have repeatedly heard the clear and convincing science of indoor transmission and infection control, we get it.

547
01:26:06.870 --> 01:26:14.880
Chris Pyke: I want to talk to you about our perspective, about how we can help facility managers put this into practice on the ground, which I think we could talk more about, then we have already.

548
01:26:15.330 --> 01:26:22.140
Chris Pyke: Over the last five years, so Arc is a little piece of the US green building Council and we have helped thousands of facilities around the world.

549
01:26:22.440 --> 01:26:30.780
Chris Pyke: measure and benchmark human experience and indoor air quality over the last year, we have adapted and extended our tools to support a safe and confident coven reentry.
Chris Pyke: I want to tell you that our work, and I believe actually the policy context that can introduce is rooted in three.

Chris Pyke: Foundational beliefs, first and foremost, that a safe re entry is based on an iterative management process.

Chris Pyke: That can be sustained over days, weeks and months we're not talking about rolling up a truck at the loading dock with 75 year commuters on it and being done that's not how this works.

Chris Pyke: Next, one is occupied engagement we haven't talked about that much yet, but teachers, students visitors can be allies in man in monitoring practices and providing feedback and thoughts, in fact, they must be.

Chris Pyke: If we are going to instill confidence and the third one is I perhaps in a little bit of.

Chris Pyke: Contrast to what we've heard already, I think that the nature of the circumstances are going to require us to measure real world outcomes.

Chris Pyke: In fact, the irreducible uncertainties we've heard so much about during the last two panels say that we must measure indoor conditions and use that to guide our actions.

Chris Pyke: So I want to actually our approach reflects a couple of things one our confidence that facility managers can create safe and comfortable learning environment, but also our experience.

Chris Pyke: That many facilities don't deliver performance consistently, we have to, we have to confront that reality.
Chris Pyke: I want to balance concern we heard repeatedly about specific mitigation technologies, whether we're talking about HIPAA or UV GI or whatever it is.

Chris Pyke: With the reality that any tool must be embedded within an effective accountable and transparent management process.

Chris Pyke: And we have put some effort into living that out, we have created free tools free guidance and free gay studies to define and support what we believe is a process, and there are available on our website I'll share where those are.

Chris Pyke: And we have folks working with us around the world to do that our approach is rooted in four elements that I think any school or school district can do, regardless of the technology involved.

Chris Pyke: One leadership every school or school district needs to empower specific individually individuals with responsibility for infection control.

Chris Pyke: and supportive TEAM members, this is foundational it can't be taken for granted, and it is more important than technology second.

Chris Pyke: Plans and procedures we've talked about how schools, how hard it is to figure out what a school district or a school is doing.

Chris Pyke: documentation of health based plans and policies with clear reference to public health authorities is absolutely critical.

Chris Pyke: And to add to that what's critical is those plans need to say what is being done and what isn't being done false positives and false negatives omission Commission.
Chris Pyke: The next third element is occupant feedback every school can and should be creating surveys and other mechanisms to get feedback from faculty staff.

Chris Pyke: Students on what they are experiencing in the classrooms they should be telling them what they should be experiencing and collecting information about what they do experience.

Chris Pyke: And that’s can and should be backed by real world monitoring.

Chris Pyke: I do, I will go up and say I reject the premise that measuring the indoor environment and schools in a targeted and and thoughtful way is any harder than installing whole new classes of technology.

Chris Pyke: These high level goals can be translated into trackable performance metrics of management and we can use it to review current conditions.

Chris Pyke: We can evaluate progress over time and we compare practices within schools and across the portfolio, we need to treat this like any other management.

Chris Pyke: activity and our approach is based on our experience that facility management actions will not always work as intended shoker.

Chris Pyke: They will fail often unexpectedly a significant portion of the time, we need to be realistic about those failures.

Chris Pyke: And we need to be realistic, that teachers and students lack mechanisms to report issues or concerns that is status quo Consequently, we are not responding fast enough.

Chris Pyke: And this is all happening over a baseline background of incomplete fragmented information about management action facility conditions and real world.
Chris Pyke: performance, that is the reality we're working on these are not technology issues they are fundamentally management and process issues that can be solved with better management that takes advantage of technology.

Chris Pyke: And so, right here today I'll kind of bring this to a close, every school can establish leadership on infection control, you should know who that person is by name.

Chris Pyke: every school can be transparent about what they are doing and what they're not doing, they can create mechanisms for feedback that costs almost nothing.

Chris Pyke: And they should prioritize measurement because that lets them make the most of what they've got and.

Chris Pyke: In so doing, I also want to know in closing that you know, we can appreciate that this has been a tough year.

Chris Pyke: it's also been a year of incredible progress, I mean we have seen some real milestones one.

Chris Pyke: We are having a great a much higher level of appreciation for connections between the indoor environment and health outcomes people get that that's the thing.

Chris Pyke: There is much higher awareness about the need to communicate with occupants and a much greater recognition that air matters.

Chris Pyke: Yet our stakeholders at the same time, they lacked in house expertise and institutional capabilities.

Chris Pyke: There is persistent uncertainty about how and when to communicate with stakeholders, we can talk about why that is.
Chris Pyke: And concerns about the costs and technical challenges of technology, so we, we are making progress, and we still have challenges so i’m going to close with three action items one is.

Chris Pyke: I believe there are if we treat this like a management problem we have tools resources and case studies available today and no cost to.

Chris Pyke: I would encourage you, we need more information, and I would encourage folks who are listening to take a survey.

Chris Pyke: The Center for green schools and ashtray have have an open survey on IQ practices in K 12 schools is open, through the end of the week.

Chris Pyke: visit the Center for green school's website, you will find a link to take the survey and tell us what's going on.

Chris Pyke: And and in partnership with asteroid we will share that back, and if you can't get enough, the last hour and a half, have not been enough.

Chris Pyke: The Green school summit for facilities and sustainability leaders is having a forum on this on Thursday and i’m happy to share more so, I appreciate the time and i’m looking forward to the discussion thanks.

Ken Bernard: Thank you very much, that leaves a lot lot for us to cover and.
Ken Bernard: it's interesting that the technology on clean air in schools is clear the cost is manageable and the problem here is in fact policy implementation of policy changing the policy to reflect what we already know, would make a difference.

Ken Bernard: For the next presentation, I want to introduce Joel Solomon he's a senior policy analyst at the national education association.

Ken Bernard: Joel currently leads any as cross departmental. Safety and Health team.

Ken Bernard: which guides any a safety and health response to the covert 19 pandemic in this capacity easter's efforts to review and enhance in person learning.

Ken Bernard: Plans for schools and institutions of higher education, develop guidance provide strategic advice and advanced members, safety and health interest within the Biden Harris administration and US government agencies Joel over to you.

Joel Solomon: Thank you very much, and thank you for inviting national education association to be with you, so far, this has been a very interesting and very helpful.

Joel Solomon: conversation, and we look forward to the outcome and further research and publications from these conversations so.
Joel Solomon: The national education association is United States largest Union we have 3 million members and 14,000 local associations around the country so when we talk about the experience of our folks and what's happening on a local level it's it's impossible to generalize.

Joel Solomon: And we also represent all categories of education employees from pre K through higher education.

Joel Solomon: Not just teachers and i'm very happy early on to hear that the conversation clearly referred to, teachers and staff we represent, of course, that PR professionals that custodial and maintenance workers school nurses and so many more.

Joel Solomon: And what I want to do today is talk about how we've approached this issue in practice.

Joel Solomon: And some of what we're, seeing as the complications of getting it done Chris you laid out some really good really important categories of analysis and folks have talked about science and what's needed.

Joel Solomon: And I want to share a little bit about what we are seeing in practice what what can be done what works well and where do we find problems, and let me just start that conversation about the what what happens on the ground.

Joel Solomon: There was discussion earlier about.

Joel Solomon: Decreasing the inhalation dose and it's important for everyone, and it is absolutely.

Joel Solomon: But we also have different types of activities that cause different types of risk in different types of indoor environments, so when we step back, we have to be very careful to say.
Joel Solomon: What are the risks in a particular area, and what are the strategies we need for that particular area, given its size, given what's happening, given what its ventilation system looks like.

Joel Solomon: We have folks that have returned to in person destruction in certain buildings, because those buildings have better ventilation.

Joel Solomon: But if we want to scale that up what's happening with those other buildings and how do we make sure they are as safe as possible as well, so this is some of some of the types of real world implications that I want to talk about.

Joel Solomon: We approach this with five basic pregnancies, first as been talked about here, but from the beginning airborne transmission is a crucial problem.

Joel Solomon: To we're not going to solve that problem on a local level immediately by upgrading or replacing hba system htc systems we don't have the time you don't have the money, and we need to be making changes now to mitigate risk.

Joel Solomon: Third, our Members are rightly very concerned about ventilation they're asking about it they're seeking solutions because.

Joel Solomon: They work in buildings, some of them were built in the 1800s some don't have windows that work, although the windows are supposed to work they're working in spaces that weren't intended for that type of work they're doing.

Joel Solomon: Outside air conditions can be really bad in places So even if you can open the windows opening them is not a good idea.

Joel Solomon: Also, the The other issue that we focused on here is, as I said, there are particularly high risk activities nursing what has to happen in nurses offices or coven isolation rooms, where we really need to think more strategicaly about solutions.
Joel Solomon: One of the other things, and I think this is what Chris was talking about that that we’ve focused on is that Union and Member engagement.

Joel Solomon: Staff teachers all stakeholders is crucial, but ventilation and ventilation solutions are seen as daunting so we have to find ways to translate.

Joel Solomon: The conversation here into manageable doable activities, not just for outside experts who come in the engineers, there has to be engagement training, education for educators of all types and the facilities staff who are working on these issues, so we can’t we can’t leave that out.

Joel Solomon: And I guess maybe I would add a six thing that we have taken into consideration as we’ve done our work, and that is.

Joel Solomon: That we found in practice.

Joel Solomon: deploying studies, however good, however important crucial for us to help us understand what’s going on, and we are working with a team of industrial hygienists and other experts to help us understand the science.

Joel Solomon: So when we’re working with folks on a local level, it is based on the science, but when it comes to a local level saying here’s a study that shows it really doesn’t work crucial information.

Joel Solomon: So our approach, there was to find what people would understand as authoritative sources, and this was part of the discussion from their first panel, what does CDC say.

Joel Solomon: What has ashtray say and how can we distill what they’re saying into usable pieces that allow people on a local level to say hey look school administration we need.
Joel Solomon: More outside air and here's why here's what CDC says about it is what ashtray says so, we have focused on those issues outside air improving filtration and also high risk areas, and how to overcome problems when mechanical ventilation systems aren't sufficient and.

Joel Solomon: Another thing we focused on and this came up a couple times, I just want to highlight it and that's the equity issue, we know that school resources and ventilation are linked, and we know that.

Joel Solomon: communities that are traditionally disadvantaged communities predominantly of color have fewer resources and we cannot let solutions be determined by finances that are not equitably distributed.

Joel Solomon: I just want to end by pointing out a couple of things that we are finding as important things that we would need moving forward.

Joel Solomon: One we can always use stronger clear guidance on airborne transmission I think everyone has identified that.

Joel Solomon: As a need, but I do want to say that, by and large, people on a local level in schools do know that ventilation is important so proving that point.

Joel Solomon: is not what we are doing on a local level what we are doing on a local level is providing.

Joel Solomon: doable low cost or no cost solutions for increasing outdoor air for making sure mechanical systems are functioning properly and those types of actions.

Joel Solomon: We also don’t want to lose momentum now to ensure that necessary maintenance, which has lagged for years and necessary upgrades are made, we need to come out of this better place, not just for the next pandemic, but for better indoor air quality.
Joel Solomon: Because it in and of itself is important we want to make sure that whatever happens on a local level is integrating the outside experts, the technical experts, the engineers with in school experts.

Joel Solomon: More than just the infection control folks folks working on hbc systems in schools, educators unions parents students, so those who know what's happening in in buildings.

Joel Solomon: data gathering and research also reaching out to those people, very important to learn as as Chris was saying what's their experience what did they know.

Joel Solomon: And one of the things that I.

Joel Solomon: We are seeing the need for greatly right now also part of the discussion here is more authoritative guidance on emerging.

Joel Solomon: Technologies we're seeing a lot of schools purchasing systems that I think people on this panel would be deeply troubled by the money is being spent, setting aside the fact that they're not always installed correctly.

Joel Solomon: on their own, but but, as I said before, having that authoritative sources that people will understand that go beyond.

Joel Solomon: A very good academic study is going to be very important for helping schools understand what they should and shouldn't be spending their money on so.

Joel Solomon: CDC and others really can play an important role in there, let me stop there, and turn it back and again, thank you very much for having us.
Ken Bernard: Thanks Joel um since time is getting short let's move quickly to our final panelist destiny amen a behavioral science and risk communication specialist with experienced.

Ken Bernard: in translating science into practical solutions to increase resilience in individual Community and national levels.

Ken Bernard: Currently, she splits her time between our own consulting practice J point collaborative and supporting the International Association for bio science and environmental criteria.

Ken Bernard: b IB EC a nonprofit focused on developing and promoting creative adoptions to the ongoing global pandemic, I might add at this point that haven't been involved with the anthrax epidemic.

Ken Bernard: The anthrax problem back in 2001 and the.

Ken Bernard: You know Ebola in 2014 in the hot wash the after action reports on both of those the principal problem and mistakes that were made, as always seen as communications, in fact, for the anthrax.

Ken Bernard: Public powder episodes communications was seen as the number one, two and three problem with our response so with pleasure, I pass this over to destiny.

Destiny Aman: Thank you so much can.

Destiny Aman: So, while the rest of these incredible folks today have been in focus primarily on the more technical elements of this problem and on its solutions.
Destiny Aman: Both from the molecular level to the policy level as a risk communications person I am interested in how we can build energy and momentum behind the solutions that they have offered here today.

Destiny Aman: How we can align understanding, where needed and drive decision making at the right levels to have the impact that we need in the right places.

Destiny Aman: First, of course, it's important to understand the barriers that we have to action from a communication standpoint, here, to begin with.

Destiny Aman: I think, as my colleagues have made very clear indoor air quality is a complex issue it's a long standing.

Destiny Aman: issue that has roots in a lot of other problems we have old buildings we have aging infrastructure we have socio economic disparities.

Destiny Aman: We have changes in federal funding we have public health deficiencies as Claire pointed out indoor air takes constant work it's not a one and done kind of solution.

Destiny Aman: That there are complexities, even down to the individual classroom space as far as what needs to be considered.

Destiny Aman: there's just a lot there and the impact of that problem results in many of our kids teachers in our school staff being exposed to unhealthy conditions, day after day.

Destiny Aman: And that was before the pandemic honestly this whole thing, taken as a whole can seem rather bleak and intractable if you're looking at it all at once.

Destiny Aman: From a comms perspective, I see the opportunity for overwhelm as very high here in this particular space.
Destiny Aman: We know from years of research that in order to get folks to act to reduce their risk.

Destiny Aman: People need to not only feel like they understand their risk, but they need to feel like there is something that they can do about it, and that that something will actually work.

Destiny Aman: it's a psychological principle called self efficacy and for decision making, it can be as important, or even more important than risk perception in terms of how it affects action.

Destiny Aman: Without a sense of self efficacy around the problem people tend to downplay or discount or discredit the message, sometimes giving up altogether.

Destiny Aman: or instead choosing options that seems simpler, or maybe just more visible or, in some cases flashier or more actionable on the surface, even if those options are not as effective.

Destiny Aman: This means that, in order to address the issues presented here around indoor air quality and schools, we need to make sure that people not only understand the issue.

Destiny Aman: And the risk presented by poor air quality, but they also need to understand the opportunity space presented by this moment, and what they can do in that opportunity space.

Destiny Aman: Unlike the interesting thing is, I think, as a frame of inquiry, unlike individual measures like masking or handwashing or vaccination or social distancing potting.

Destiny Aman: Environmental mitigation actions like ventilation and filtration they're less political they're less reliant on personal decision making and more easily implemented through existing maintenance structures building policy channels all.
Destiny Aman: Any one of us has only to talk with a family member or a rogue Facebook friend about masks or vaccines to know how entrenched the beliefs already are around these particular individual behaviors.

Destiny Aman: And well teachers across the country are working hard to enforce masking requirements and encouraging kids to wash their hands.

Destiny Aman: and maintain social distance, these are difficult behaviors even for adults to maintain and teachers have a ton on their plates with balancing hybrid teaching on top of in person teaching figuring out new technologies in their classrooms and new schedules in the class.

Destiny Aman: Some of these schools are also physically not able to maintain social distance I actually interviewed a public school music teacher in Arizona, this weekend, who described some of these detailed surface cleaning routines.

Destiny Aman: With what she called scary toxic chemicals sprayed by students at the end of each class to wipe down their area their seating areas.

Destiny Aman: Fathers in the in the school and the school and all of this in a classroom with 28 students in a room no social distancing and singing i’ll be at mast but singing by the choir.

Destiny Aman: She also described contract contact tracing as an imaginary circle drawn around the infected student and the six or so students seated around them.

Destiny Aman: being asked to quarantine but not the rest of the classroom of 28 students or the students sitting shoulder to shoulder in the cafeteria with no masks.

Destiny Aman: This is a great example of what happens when we overly focus on the individual frame.
Destiny Aman: And we don’t focus enough on the environmental frame because there’s quite a lot of solution in that space.

Destiny Aman: That can be helpful, regardless of what folks are doing internally now, of course, that means we want to still support all of those individual decisions.

Destiny Aman: A way to reduce risk in the background, regardless of what all is going on in the classroom and there’s a lot going on in the classroom.

Destiny Aman: So this is why I focus needs to be balanced, the individual focus needs to be balanced with a focus on indoor environment, especially air.

Destiny Aman: Because even with those entrenched issues that I mentioned, we can safely and effectively implement many of these actions with the tools we have now, and they will work to reduce the risks in our schools.

Destiny Aman: Increasing ventilation and filtration is not first not going to do arm, which we certainly can’t say about the things that we’re using now as this panel session has has brought to light.

Destiny Aman: Now beyond, of course, the initial triage measures that we may want to advocate at the individual school level, we certainly do want to address some of the underlying issues in schools.

Destiny Aman: You know, we really need to if we want to ensure a good learning environment for our kids and we have an opportunity to help address some of those disparities by prioritizing air quality in schools, moving forward.
Destiny Aman: With many schools set to reopen in the next few months, there is good work to be done now, and a lot of smart science behind it and by targeting schools, we actually target the arteries of communities, we raise Community health by addressing health and schools.

Destiny Aman: All of you can help at lots of different levels we know we have teachers and administrators who are can push for these kinds of improvements in their schools.

Destiny Aman: We have parents that can agitate and are often very successful at the school level and agitating for improvements and all kinds of different school policies.

Destiny Aman: and members of the public can contact the representatives and share this information, call upon the administration to appropriately recognize the power of these options and the good science behind them in their policymaking.

Destiny Aman: Honestly, in the wake of other national crises that we've seen over the course of history.

Destiny Aman: US has always realized certain kinds of advancements to science infrastructure, education and they've carried us through the crisis and into the future.

Destiny Aman: The pandemic offers a slew of opportunities to build back better and to improve national resilience long term.

Destiny Aman: just getting back to normal is not good enough, in fact, it was normal that led us to the pandemic in the first place.

Destiny Aman: We have the tools to do better, and this is a great place to start i’m happy to talk more about how we can support decision making on the part of policymakers and others in a position to make a difference, thank you.
Ken Bernard: Thank you very much.

Ken Bernard: Margaret are you going to pick some questions here.

Margaret Miller: Yes, thank you so much, and so this question is for Joel, I believe, are you seeing schools applying for federal covenant cares grant funding to improve their indoor air quality, or maybe somebody else can answer that but.

Joel Solomon: We do know of schools that have done that, and we certainly hope there will be more funding available, but as Claire said targeting funding toward the right things and making sure funding is not misused for some bells and whistles are flashing your technologies that aren't proven.

Margaret Miller: is going to be really important as we go forward.

Margaret Miller: Great thanks and we're still.

Margaret Miller: This question is, I still cannot see how all this information gets translated to the level of persuading and decision making school board or administration, are there any school superintendents or school boards who model these strategies.

Margaret Miller: That could advocate to other districts across the country.

Chris Pyke: Is that, for me, I can I can.

Joel Solomon: answer you know.

Joel Solomon: The things that we've done.
Joel Solomon: In trying to take CDC and ashtray and EPA guidance and put it in two very clear distilled language.

Joel Solomon: When our folks sit down with school districts and say hey.

Joel Solomon: This is important we do that, not because we think anyone sitting at a table having those conversations is going to walk into a classroom and be able to measure the air changes taking place.

Joel Solomon: But in order to facilitate a discussion about what being done around indoor air quality to mitigate coven and, yes, there are a lot of schools where they they understand that and those conversations.

Chris Pyke: are constructive sometimes it's a.

Chris Pyke: fight.

Joel Solomon: But they get it we've had places where.

Joel Solomon: we've provided information on bipolar ionization and said before you move forward, you need to be looking for independent studies So yes, there are examples out there, it certainly does happen, but it happens most.

Chris Pyke: When.

Joel Solomon: We are using distilled.
728
01:55:45.360 --> 01:55:51.390
Joel Solomon: clear language, based on things that people recognize as authoritative.

729
01:55:52.710 --> 01:56:00.300
Chris Pyke: And let me, let me jump in after Joel I just think about two things so one is I had also shared as an answer several questions.

730
01:56:00.690 --> 01:56:07.920
Chris Pyke: We have clear examples of schools and school districts actually all around the world across the US who are using.

731
01:56:08.340 --> 01:56:21.480
Chris Pyke: The kinds of processes processes that I described so it's not an absence of exemplar examples, it is certainly an example of trying to get maybe the average school district to move certainly my own school district.

732
01:56:22.530 --> 01:56:30.120
Chris Pyke: These these are huge challenges so it's not the exemplary case study that we're lacking, we have those and i'm happy to share those.

733
01:56:30.390 --> 01:56:39.870
Chris Pyke: The other pieces, I think, in our experience, I wanted to kind of bring this into the conversation I think that schools have no idea what they can and should be communicating.

734
01:56:40.290 --> 01:56:47.940
Chris Pyke: They are really tied and not about whether they are whether they're creating liabilities for themselves whether there are risks.

735
01:56:48.240 --> 01:56:56.850
Chris Pyke: And we so we see a lot I guess what i’m trying to explain is, I think it looks like a duck with the feet going underwater and there's tons of of activity going on underwater.

736
01:56:57.120 --> 01:57:03.840
Chris Pyke: But a real a real challenge sometimes people don't want to share sometimes they don't know what they can share.

737
01:57:04.050 --> 01:57:12.900
Chris Pyke: The bottom line is one of the reasons we don't see much communication, I believe I certainly see this in the hundreds of projects we're working with is they, they just don't know what they can share.
Chris Pyke: And at the end of the day, that's one of the reasons in my remarks I tried to elevate this to the level of management problem.

Chris Pyke: If you're dealing with the superintendent or the school board, this is a management problem, it is not a technology problem.

Chris Pyke: It is equally effective in increasing outdoor air to open a window and have cross ventilation, as it is to install whatever.

Chris Pyke: Your goal is to stop reading someone else's air as as Simon said, so the question is, I want to be clear that there's that the struggle that folks are having is yes, we have good example, it can be done.

Chris Pyke: Most folks don't know what they can say or should say and they're worried about getting sued in any number of ways.

Chris Pyke: And they're scared of their stakeholders up one side and down the other and that was here before Kobe it as something destiny was saying and it's going to be here Africa of it.

Chris Pyke: And we should talk about it and that did where we can help them, but we need to bring the right help to the right level of decision maker so two cents 50 cents.

Simon Turner: You.

Claire Barnett: From.

Claire Barnett: You know, I have a comment, based on.
Claire Barnett: A lot of the conversation is really, really helpful at a technical level for an individual school pandemic means everybody.

Claire Barnett: And one of the things we have to be able to do is get all schools to behave, not just the lucky few that have to be that are part of the willing coalition that become exemplars because they happen to have.

Claire Barnett: Low turnover and leadership or whatever, I think that there are a couple of examples from states that we've picked up through recent.

Claire Barnett: Work one is Rhode island where the very progressive Governor of Rhode island actually convened the National Guard, along with school health professionals.

Claire Barnett: and other groups and put together teams and they actually did school walk through every single public school before the opening of schools.

Claire Barnett: it's that's it's a real eye opener and I know john Hopkins participated in some of that that's one example, it was you know go through with a checklist it's not a formal inspection.

Claire Barnett: Another was Vermont which I think dead project statewide project with Ashley I believe.

Claire Barnett: To take a look at Vermont schools and help them with individual decisions, whether they were opening windows or installing box fans are maximizing their age hvac systems.

Claire Barnett: There are so many different options it was helpful to have that technical assistance in place to make things a little bit simpler.
Claire Barnett: Another was New York state where the governor took a position on terms of the pandemic that they wanted all schools to do the same thing they put together a list of things and said thou shalt create.

Claire Barnett: A written policy around indoor air around cleaning around masking around distancing these you know long checklist you will submit them to the health department and we will look at them before you open another approach.

Claire Barnett: So I think one of the things I worry about when I think about only local examples is the fact that this is a pandemic, it is all children and the children who are in the worst shape are in.

Claire Barnett: Are the poorest children who are black Latino six and native American who are in the poorest communities that were already heard, to sit by coven.

Claire Barnett: And the schools literally don't have the staff, the knowledge, the capacity or the funds actually to carry things out I think there's a crisis is is far greater.

Claire Barnett: than perfect solutions, I think we really and I want all children back in school, I have grandchildren in Colorado, believe me, their parents want them in.

Claire Barnett: So why.

Ken Bernard: Can I make a comment on this, I think, somewhere CDC someone said earlier, I think, rich corsi that.

Ken Bernard: CDC.
Chris Pyke: People are looking to CDC for guidance, they just.

Ken Bernard: put out a very long.

Ken Bernard: School opening document and there's one small paragraph that mentions ventilation and it's just generic.

Ken Bernard: I don't understand why I worked in policy in Washington for 30 years and usually it's money or power is the reason pick which one of those two things.

Ken Bernard: proud of the problem with education and always has been, is the decentralization, the States and the local school districts have a huge amount of power, compared to.

Ken Bernard: A lot of other federal issues, but I think CDC needs to actually take what has been said here and revise its recommendations and put in a section on that relation, I think that would help in a wet Claire just only.

Claire Barnett: I want to add to that if you don't mind, though, can because my understanding of the layered approach inside CDC.

Claire Barnett: Is there were quite a few medical professionals writing the guidance and in my own world i'm wondering how many of them have when was the last time they step foot in an inner city or rural, remote school.

Ken Bernard: You don't want it.

Claire Barnett: They don't know the patient right they've got it they haven't really quite diagnosed and gotten the right.
Claire Barnett: prescription yet.

Ken Bernard: And I think in this situation, somebody else mentioned, there should be a group in Washington, setting the policy that involves CDC the Department of Education EPA, etc.

Claire Barnett: Commission.

Ken Bernard: Absolutely some kind, I think that would be a very smart move also.

Simon Turner: there's another element.

Simon Turner: Here, can I throw in a comment is another element here regarding I mean test destiny said.

Simon Turner: there's no politics in recommending improve ventilation infiltration courses politics and everything If only that were true there's no politics.

Simon Turner: and politics around ventilation is energy codes that climate change warriors will really struggle to release their grip on energy codes they fought.

Simon Turner: long and hard for them, and now we're saying you know what we'd really like to double your ventilation rates there's energy costs associated with that and.

Simon Turner: I don't know if that's behind the CDC reluctance, I doubt it but there's plenty of people who are really going to resist changing energy codes and loosening them up after that the you know the years and years of fighting to tighten them.
Richard Corsi: add my may I add to this, I think this is an important point that hasn't been brought up is that all of this points to the importance of interdisciplinary collaboration.

Richard Corsi: You know epidemiologists are great at what they do medical doctors are great at what they do engineers can be great at what they do aerosol businesses.

Richard Corsi: I think it was a destiny early mentioned something and I wrote down on a piece of paper human behavior lists.

Richard Corsi: To understand all this stuff we need the social sciences, the in you know engineering physics microbiologist epidemiologist medical doctors working together, and that has not happened at all this past year and that's been a tragedy.

Richard Corsi: You know, we should learn from that.

William Bahnfleth: i'd like to follow on the energy versus IQ issue, because we have to get over that we have to start looking for ways that we can.

William Bahnfleth: have both if the only way to have energy efficiency is to have bad indoor air quality we're on the wrong track, so we have to.

William Bahnfleth: overcome the adversarial approach, and I think we can, if you just Commission buildings, you would save as much energy as the increased ventilation would would cost, so there are lots of ways to deal with that issue.

Chris Pyke: And just to build on what Joe said empirically this the notion of a yes in a model I can get there to be a big trade off between energy and indoor.
Chris Pyke: Air and and However, if we look at thousands of buildings, as we do every single day and we published it every single day.

Chris Pyke: The best lowest carbon buildings have the highest levels of IQ and occupant satisfaction, there is not a real world trade off that can’t be surmounted by hundreds or thousands of buildings in the real world so that’s.

Chris Pyke: just want to support the whole lot of thinking.

Joel Solomon: I just want to come back to the practical and the local and the immediate because part of what we’re talking about is ventilation related mitigation strategies and I don’t think the looking for.

Joel Solomon: Solutions increasing outdoor air safely increasing filtration it’s not getting hung up on broad policy debates and it’s not getting hung up on.

Joel Solomon: debate between different disciplines it's getting hung up on the practical as best we said and and we see this certainly at Nea.

Joel Solomon: And, as I, as I said, people think it's daunting they don’t know how to do it so giving them practical tools to engage when we talk with our affiliates, the first thing we do is explain why airborne transmission matters transmission matters.

Joel Solomon: We talk about the practical things that can be done opening dampers and windows safely and and the things they need to think about and we talked about negative.

Joel Solomon: positive pressure, but just opening a window isn't necessarily going to be a solution, people have to understand depends if there’s a high risk area next door and the way the air flows between two rooms so.
Joel Solomon: But getting people comfortable with what they need to be asking and making sure
that people responsible for decision making, or working with stakeholders, including their
unions.

Joel Solomon: And and employees, there are practical solutions is getting hung up on process on
understanding and i‘m not sure and a local level and immediate level these these big debates
which are very important or what’s holding it up.

Ken Bernard: I gotta go.

Ken Bernard: Here, and you have to, we have to get off to.

Ken Bernard: pass this off to Margaret or gigi to close this up.

Gigi Gronvall: Yes, I was just gonna say that’s a good note to leave this on this has been a really
wonderful and rich discussion for the last couple of hours.

Gigi Gronvall: I just want to thank Dr policies gave for her leadership on this issue and the
panelists and the production team for everything that they've done to make this a success.

Gigi Gronvall: And to let everyone know that we are going to have this webinar available to you,
it will be up later on today.

Gigi Gronvall: We are going to be writing a report that will be able to email all of the people who
registered for this event, we will send you a copy so so be be prepared.

Gigi Gronvall: and we look forward to hearing from you have other opportunities that we can we
can engage on these issues and to educate people about what they can do about ventilation in
school so with that Thank you all very much and we look forward to hearing from you take care,
thank you.